City Growth and Regeneration Committee

Wednesday, 11th January, 2017

MEETING OF CITY GROWTH AND REGENERATION COMMITTEE

Members present: Councillor Graham (Chairperson);

Aldermen Haire, McGimpsey, L. Patterson and Spence; and

Councillors Beattie, Dorrian, Dudgeon, Hargey, Howard, Johnston, Kyle, Magee, McAteer, McDonough-Brown, Mullan,

O'Hara and Walsh.

In attendance: Mrs. S. Wylie, Chief Executive;

Mr. D. Durkan, Director of Development;

Ms. N. Gallagher, Director of City Centre Development;

Mr. N. Grimshaw, Director of City and Neighbourhood Services; and

Mrs. L. McLornan, Democratic Services Officer.

Apologies

No apologies for inability to attend were reported.

Minutes

The minutes of the meetings of 7th December were taken as read and signed as correct. It was reported that those minutes had been adopted by the Council at its meeting on 3rd January.

Declarations of Interest

Councillor Dudgeon declared an interest in the Item "Request to present to Committee – Belfast City Centre Management" in that, as a representative of the Council, he was a Board Member.

Presentation

Cyber

The Chairperson welcomed Mr. Stephen Wray, Deloitte and Director of Cyber, and Mr. David Crozier, Head of Strategic Partnerships and Engagement in the Electronics, Communications and Information Technology (ECIT) institute at Queen's University, to the meeting.

The Director of Cyber provided the Committee with an overview of what cyber security was and why it was important in terms of city growth. He advised the Committee that Belfast had emerged as a global hub for cyber security and highlighted that the Centre for Secure Information Technologies (CSIT) at Queen's University was the largest cyber

security centre in Europe and that it was recognised by Government Communication Headquarters (GCHQ) as academic centre of excellence.

He outlined to the Members that, globally, cyber security was a tremendous growth area and that there was a shortage of talent, with 1million open job roles currently in the field, with an average salary of £40,000. The Members were advised that Belfast was the number one in the world for USA Foreign Direct Investment (FDI) in cyber security, with 1,200 new jobs having been created here in recent years by companies including IBM, AlertLogic, Proofpoint, Whitehat, Rapid7 and BlackDuck. The Committee was advised that both Scotland and Ireland had strategies on cyber security and that, given Northern Ireland had proven itself to have excelled in the subject, it was therefore important to continue to build on that momentum. Mr. Wray advised the Committee that the Department of the Economy (DoE) had highlighted cyber security as a key priority to drive economic growth in Northern Ireland.

The representatives provided the Members with a number of high profile examples where companies, such as TalkTalk and the NHS, had been hacked and outlined the hassle and data breaches which were caused. In response to a Member's question regarding companies' responsibilities in protecting personal data, Mr. Wray advised the Committee that the General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR) would come into force in May 2018. He outlined that GDPR were EU privacy and data protection compliance requirements which would require all companies holding personal consumer data to have a certain level of security and would impose fines on companies which did not. He highlighted that this would come into force before the earliest possible Brexit, so UK companies would have to comply with the legislation.

In response to a further Member's question in relation to whether training on early digital safety should be incorporated into the early years curricula, Mr. Crozier advised the Members that he sat on a subject advisory panel for a forthcoming 'digital technology' GCSE. He advised the Members that he felt there was always more to do but that Science, Technology, Engineering and Maths (STEM) were key and it was promising that Northern Ireland had the best results for maths at a primary level in Europe.

After further discussion, the Chairperson thanked the representatives for their presentation and they retired from the meeting.

Restricted Items

The information contained in the following three reports is restricted in accordance with Part 1 of Schedule 6 of the Local Government Act (Northern Ireland) 2014.

Interactive 3D City Model

The Director of City Centre Development reminded the Committee that, at its meeting on 14th September, 2016, it had agreed that aerial photography be carried out for the creation of a 3D model of the city. She advised the Committee that the necessary flights and photography had now been undertaken and outlined that she was seeking Committee permission to engage with VuCity to develop the next stages of a 3D model

of Belfast. The Members were advised that the next stage of work would include the modelling of the areas which had been photographed, processing and software development, software updates and ongoing support.

In response to a Member's question, the Committee noted that this stage of work would cost approximately £36,000.

After discussion, the Committee:

- noted that the necessary flights / photography had been successfully undertaken;
- agreed that work would commence on the next stages, namely:
 - modelling of areas photographed at a cost of approximately £500 per square mile: City Core, City Airport, Titanic Quarter, North Foreshore;
 - processing and Software development;
 - software and modelling updates;
 - ongoing support and maintenance;
- agreed that an appropriate partnership with VuCity be established with a suitable operating model to develop the next stages of the 3D Model; and
- agreed that the VuCity demonstration video would be made available to the Planning Committee at a future meeting.

Potential Land Acquisition

The Committee noted and endorsed the decision taken by the Strategic Policy and Resources Committee, that the Council would pursue the potential acquisition of Commission House, on the basis of the Land and Property Services valuation, but subject to the Council obtaining its own independent valuation and undertaking other due diligence, with a further report to be submitted to the Committee prior to any final decisions.

Zoo Report

The Director of City and Neighbourhood Services provided the Committee with an overview of the recommendations which had been made by the European Association of Zoos and Aquaria (EAZA) in relation to the Belfast Zoo.

He outlined to the Members the Action Plan which had been created to execute the recommendations and advised the Committee that EAZA had stated that it was content to receive updates on the progress which had been made and that it did not feel that a follow up visit was required.

After discussion, the Committee:

- noted that an acting Zoo Manager had been appointed;
- noted the progress with the actions on the issues which had been raised by EAZA; and

agreed to receive updates on the progress of the action plan.

Request to Present to Committee

Belfast City Centre Management

The Committee agreed to accede to a request from Belfast City Centre Management to present at the Committee meeting on 8th March, 2017.

Castlebrook Investments

The Committee agreed to receive a presentation from Castlebrook Investments at a future meeting in relation to the development of the former Royal Exchange site.

Positioning Belfast to Compete

Routes Conference 2017

The Committee considered the undernoted report:

"1.0 Purpose of Report

1.1 The purpose of this report is to update Members on the upcoming business tourism event taking place in Belfast in April 2017, the annual Routes Europe Conference.

2.0 Recommendations

- 2.1 The Committee is asked to:
 - Note the update on the Routes Europe Conference which will take place in Belfast for the first time on 23-25 April 2017.

3.0 Main report

- 3.1 In October 2016, the Council agreed to commit £100,000 to support the costs of hosting the 2017 Routes Europe event at Belfast Waterfront. Routes Europe have indicated that the benefits to a city hosting the event in terms of positive PR coverage, potential new airline routes announcements and additional leisure/business tourism visitors, could be in the region of more than £50million. This is based on feedback and measurement of Routes Conferences that have been held in other cities.
- 3.2 The bid for Belfast involves financial contributions from a range of partners. These include:

- Approximately £348,000 agreed by Invest NI. (In addition, they have spent £137,000 securing the Routes Conference for Belfast City)
- Tourism Ireland (TIL) £20,000
- Tourism NI (TNI) £165,000
- Visit Belfast £20,000
- BWUH Ltd £10,000
- Local airports approximately £100,000 each
- 3.3 In addition to these funding contributions, all partners are also making additional contributions in-kind in order to ensure the success of the event.
- 3.4 Routes Europe is a particularly attractive Conference due to the economic impact that it will have, particularly on potential new air routes. It is the largest regional gathering for all aviation-based companies operating in Europe. This major international event brings together decision makers from airlines, airports and tourism authorities to negotiate and build relationships that will shape the world's future air route networks. Routes events occupy a unique position, both in the field of aviation and as an economic development catalyst. Air transport is one of the means of regional economic development and Routes delivers to the event and the host city the key decision makers within the industry.
- 3.5 Routes Europe is an annual event which takes place in major European cities over a three day period. Following the successful bid by Belfast, the Routes Europe 2017 event will take place in the city on 23-25 April 2017. The delegates are considered to be 'guests' of Routes and therefore of the host city, which will provide Belfast with a rare opportunity to bring influential decision makers into the city, make them welcome, build a relationship with them and seek future partnerships.
- 3.6 It is estimated that the event will attract around 1,000 delegates representing more than 100 global airlines, airports and tourism promotion agencies. In addition to the significant financial impact of the delegate spend estimated at around £1.3million the event presents an excellent opportunity to demonstrate the economic and tourism potential of the city of Belfast to a range of decision-makers, focusing on the key messaging identified within the emerging city narrative whilst showcasing all that is on offer for airlines, tourists, businesses and inward investors. It also provides the City with an opportunity to positively change perceptions about our airports and Belfast as a destination. There is a significant promotional campaign underway for the event at present, and one of the key recent promotional opportunities has been at

the World Routes conference which took place in Chengdu, China in September 2016.

- 3.7 The main Conference and showcase will take place in the Belfast Waterfront while a welcome reception will be held in Belfast City Hall and a gala networking event in Titanic Belfast. Organisers and the local team are working closely together on a programme of supporting events across the city. This 'Team Belfast' approach has ensured joined-up working with all partners. Research shows that the host city has a significant impact on delegates' overall satisfaction and the Belfast Waterfront will be able to showcase that it can deliver well-organised meetings and a high standard of events in a luxurious, state of the art, riverside location presenting a positive impression of the city.
- 3.8 In addition to the main conference programme, the local planning group is currently looking at animating the city during the event. This may include banners as well as some cultural animation. Tourism NI is also providing four delegate tours and these will be offered as part of a side programme to the main conference.
- 3.9 The Routes Europe Conference has the potential to accelerate air route development. Previous host cities report that they have secured agreement on up to six new routes after holding the event as well as increases in airline operations over subsequent years. Members will be aware that air route connectivity has been identified as one of the most critical elements required to support future tourism and business growth. The Integrated Tourism Strategy noted that limitations in air route connections to key business destinations was one of the most significant challenges to the ambition of doubling the value of tourism. Routes Europe helps support a fundamental part of the business tourism strategy – business and leisure tourism is of key importance in growing the tourism industry and doubling tourism spend by 2020.
- 3.10 The Northern Ireland Executive has invested in a range of incentives to secure key routes from the region's airports. Despite this, there are opportunities for further development particularly to a number of key European business hubs and it is considered that this event will be a critical part of work to secure these new routes. Longer-term benefits will also come from the extensive international PR coverage for Belfast that the Conference will generate and this can be used to profile the city as an attractive leisure and business tourism destination and to carry some of the key messages around the business and investment opportunities in the city.

- 3.11 To ensure the successful delivery of the event and ensure that the City realises the full benefits of hosting such a Conference three working groups have been set up to co-ordinate the event:
 - Marketing/Communications group
 Met 7 November. Working group with Event-ful Event
 Management company and all stakeholders to get partners up to speed on all aspects of event.
 - Logistics group
 Met 14 November. Working group with Invest NI, Visit
 Belfast, Event-ful Event Management, Tourism NI,
 Belfast International Airport, Belfast City Airport and
 Belfast Waterfront specifically relating to logistics,
 airport welcome, coach tendering and delegate
 transport and scheduling.
 - Events group
 Met 15 November. Working group with Invest NI, Visit Belfast, Event-ful Event Management, Tourism NI and Belfast City Council specifically relating to Welcome reception, networking event and animating the city
- 3.12 These groups will continue to meet in the run-up to the event in order to ensure that all planning details for the event are taken care of and that the City makes the most of this opportunity to showcase Belfast as a successful business and tourism destination. A further progress report on all of this work will be brought to Committee prior to the April 2017 event.
- 3.13 Financial and Resource Implications

The £100,000 funding allocation has already been approved by the Committee and is built into the 2016/17 budget and Q2 year end forecast.

3.14 Equality or Good Relations Implications

No specific equality or good relations implications."

The Director of Development confirmed that the full programme for the conference would be circulated to all Members and, in response to a Member's question, he emphasised that their attendance would be encouraged.

The Committee adopted the recommendations within the report and agreed that a further report be submitted to the Committee in advance of the conference to provide the Members with key information.

Growing Businesses and the Economy

Support for Small and Medium-sized Enterprises

The Committee considered the undernoted report:

"1.0 Purpose of Report

- 1.1 The purpose of this report is to present the proposed direction of travel regarding the Council's support for Business Start-Up, Business Growth, Job Creation, Skills Development and Investment in order to meet the ambitions set out in the Belfast Agenda.
- 1.2 The Belfast Agenda has recently been issued for consultation, with ambitious targets to grow the Belfast economy through supporting small businesses, attracting investment, creating jobs and developing skills. Whilst Belfast City Council has been involved in the development and delivery of support services to small businesses for almost 20 years, a significant step-change is now required in the services and programmes provided within the Development Department. The transfer of enterprise powers, alongside the Community Planning powers, provides a clear opportunity for the Council to take a much more significant leadership role in this regard.
- 1.3 This report sets out the current thinking on significantly enhancing the small business and investment services and aligning this with the planned employability and skills programmes.
- 1.4 It should be noted that further reports will be brought back to Committee as specific business propositions are developed. However it is vital that there is additional investment in 2017/18 under the Belfast Agenda budget line to enable this preparatory and developmental work to be undertaken.

2.0 Recommendations

2.1 The Committee is asked to:

- Note and approve the direction of travel for Council support for business Start, business growth, job creation, skills development and Investment, as set out in 3.10-3.18
- Agree to receive update reports setting out full details of the new programme activity at a future meeting of the Committee

 Agree that a tender exercise can be undertaken at this point for a Small Business Procurement Support Programme to begin in 2017/2018.

3.0 Main report

3.1 Belfast Agenda Targets

Members will be aware that inclusive economic growth is a central theme of the Belfast Agenda. Over the next five years the draft Belfast Agenda commits the Council to lead on:

- The creation of 15,000 new jobs;
- Support for 4,000 small business start-ups; and
- Attracting £1 billion of private sector Foreign Direct Investment.

3.2 Current Challenges

Low Business Start-up rates. Members will be aware that the business start-up rate in the City lags significantly behind other locations across Northern Ireland and is also lower than other comparator cities in UK and Ireland. The recent Centre for Cities Outlook Report indicated that Business Start-up rates in Belfast were the lowest of all 63 cities considered as part of the analysis, at less than 30 people per 10,000 of population starting a business in the city. This compares to 100 in London and 56 in Bristol.

- 3.3 Low Productivity Levels. The secondary challenge is that the productivity levels in Belfast are much lower than other cities. This has an impact on wage levels and overall city competitiveness. The deficit can be illustrated by looking at levels of innovation in the economy, as measured by the number of patents filed. In the Centre for Cities Outlook, Belfast ranks 60 out of the 63 cities in terms of patents filed by businesses. In Belfast, the figure is 1.1 patent filed per head of population. This can be set against a figure of 102 patents per head of population for Cambridge, 20 in Aberdeen and 8 in Bristol.
- 3.4 Not enough people with high enough skills. One of the major contributory factors to a lower productivity rate is the skills levels in the City. While Belfast performs relatively well in terms of higher level skills, it ranks 62 out of the 63 cities in terms of residents who have no formal qualifications. This not only impacts on productivity levels but also creates additional social challenges within the city. Forecasts suggest that only 1 in 6 of new jobs to be created will be open to those with no

or low skills levels. This presents a significant risk for those residents who currently have no or low skills in terms of their ability to access employment opportunities in the future.

- 3.5 Need to continue focus on FDI. Whilst Belfast has over the last 7 or 8 years, performed very well in terms of inward investment (ranking second behind London in UK terms), it is vital that this success is built upon and that the proposition is developed further for a post Brexit situation, to ensure that Belfast can compete successfully with other similar cities.
- 3.6 Therefore the broader challenges in terms of business start, business growth, Investment and skills development are:
 - The need to grow the overall number of businesses starting up in the city
 - The need to make those businesses more viable, productive and competitive
 - The need to ensure that businesses have access to the talent pipeline and expertise and that they need to help them reach their potential
 - The need to maintain and improve the profile of the city as a dynamic, cost competitive investment location.
 - The need for implementation of a Belfast skills development strategy, linked to the Belfast Works programme
- 3.7 In developing linked programmes of work to address these challenges, the aim will be to make indigenous businesses themselves more competitive, attract more business to the City and hence create more jobs, skills pipelines and also increase the rates base.

3.8 What we already do

- <u>Starting a business</u>: current activities include a range of targeted outreach initiatives with key groups to encourage them to consider starting a business. This includes targeted support for social enterprises and for students starting a business
- Growing a business: our current support in this area is focused on a number of key projects including the Innovation Factory, export development opportunities for local businesses through our international links and initiatives to help businesses to access opportunities from public procurement
- <u>Investing in Belfast</u>: This involves a wide range of programmes working alongside Invest NI. In the last 18 months our activities have increased extensively

with a new international relations framework and more business/investment focused relationships with China, Boston and Nashville, a programme of inward visits, new marketing plans and investment portfolios.

 Skills Development: In the last 18 months a new Employability and Skills Framework has been developed which includes; the development of programmes to deliver skills development and employment opportunities for those furthest from the labour market; engagement with educational institutions to support higher level skills programmes in line with employer needs; and programmes to support upskilling for those seeking to progress in employment.

3.9 What we are proposing to do:

Meeting the targets outlined in the Belfast Agenda will require a significant uplift in the investment and resource commitment from the Council to ensure that, along with partner organisations, we develop a menu of the right support services and programmes.

3.10 A Small Business Support Service

We propose to develop and market a comprehensive and coordinated 'small business service' that will ensure that companies get access to the help they need, when they need it and that there is no duplication in provision across partner organisations.

3.11 In 2017/18 the development of such a service will involve:

- Exploring the viability of additional financial incentives for specific target groups in starting a business e.g. young people, residents in disadvantaged areas;
- Developing a mentoring programme for small business starts, with access to expertise and helping to support business to business links;
- Collaboration with universities, Belfast Metropolitan College and Catalyst Inc. to develop a strong tech start programme. This will include looking at new models of flexible workspace provision alongside wrap-around support services in line with the business needs
- Developing large-scale enterprise education initiatives to embed the entrepreneurial culture at an early age and to promote positive role models who have started their own business. There will be a focus on new growth sectors and emerging areas.

- Expansion of Student Enterprise programmes, building on the award-winning Belfast Enterprise Academy, to help college and university students develop their business ideas alongside their academic studies
- Expansion of the core Business Start (Go for It) programme focusing on those businesses that have the greatest growth potential or that are in key growth sectors.
- Development of the Innovation Factory, with a target of creating almost 400 additional jobs by 2020 across over 100 new businesses as well as exploring opportunities for additional workspace provision, focused on key growth sectors e.g. creative and digital businesses.
- Developing a number of specific sector growth strategies. These will be based on existing specialisms and will include industries such as cyber security, financial technology and creative and digital. Key actions are likely to include generating additional international business opportunities through Sister City and wider global connections, targeted skills development initiatives in the key sectors, support for additional research and development, developing additional networking opportunities to encourage greater collaboration between local companies (and FDI businesses located here)
- Exploring potential accelerator projects and investment funds to support high growth businesses.
 We are currently working with Boston-based funds partners to look at the potential of running a similar programme in Belfast. We also intend to use the Resilient City global networks, which may also assist in the development of a small business commission for the city.
- Delivery of a 1-2-1 business mentoring programme for all companies interested in business growth. This will include support on issues such as marketing, doing business online, exploring export markets, managing cashflow and new product development
- Development of export development and international business opportunities, focusing on Sister City connections.
- Helping companies to explore new business opportunities presented by public procurement. We have already delivered previous support programmes of this nature and the participating companies have accessed more than £1.5million in new business
- Exploring supply chain opportunities arising from new regeneration and development opportunities and

ensuring that local businesses are aware of and positioned to take advantage of these opportunities.

3.12 Investment Advice Service

We would propose to establish an Investment Advice Service which will:

- Develop and actively market the unique 'City Proposition' for international investors and aim to improve the experience of new and existing investors in the City
- Work with Sister City and other key investment destinations to promote Belfast as an investment location for key sectors and to encourage investment in the City's future infrastructure development
- Work with London and Dublin in particular to explore business opportunities post-Brexit and to develop the City's business proposition to exploit the future growth and investment potential.

3.13 Skills Development and Employability

- The Employability and Skills Framework adopted by the committee last year, following consultation, outlines the ambition to:
- Link to the Belfast Works Programme to develop skills and employment opportunities for those furthest from the labour market,
- Engage with educational institutions to support higher level skills programmes in line with employer needs and programmes to support upskilling for those seeking to progress in employment, with particular focus on key growth sectors.
- Develop and roll-out future phases of the Hospitality Employment Academy (HEA) and development of other similar programmes in other key growth sectors.
- Develop higher skills programmes in key sectors, e.g. cyber sector, to ensure the development of world-class research leadership as well as an increased graduate talent pool for business.

3.14 Leadership

The Council has just set up a new Economic Think Tank for the City with key anchor institutions and Belfast Business. This will be developed further into a wider Economic Forum for the City to help advice the Council in stepping up these activities.

3.14 Research and Specific Support

It is proposed that a number of research pieces are undertaken to inform the proposed new interventions and also to ensure that progress is tracked. These will include:

- Accessing ongoing policy support from the UU Economic Policy Centre: as a sponsor of the Centre, the Council is represented on the Advisory Board and has access to a wide range of research and analysis work that impacts on our key priority areas of work. These include economic inactivity, the impact of Welfare Reform and implications of Corporation Tax reductions
- Research to help establish an enterprise framework for the city: this research will identify the quantum between current start-up levels and where the city needs to be in terms of volume of businesses. It will also look at how the productivity levels in the city can be improved by encouraging more high level start-ups. This will help the Council to fine-tune its own activity and will help influence investments by other partners, many of whom are also part of the Community Planning Partnership. It will shape the Business Start and Business Growth work
- Research on barriers to starting a business: this
 research will help understand perceived barriers. This
 will be shared with partners involved in the delivery of
 Business Start support and will help shape future
 investment.
- 3.16 One of the specific programmes for which the business case has already been developed is the programme to help companies access public procurement opportunities, including opportunities from Belfast City Council. This support has been ongoing for a number of years and participating companies have benefitted greatly from their involvement. Over the last three years, 71 local companies have taken part and they have secured new business to a value of more than £1.5million - an average win of almost £22,000 per participating company.
- 3.17 The current programme will end in March 2017. It is proposed that a tender for delivery of the new programme is issued with an option for the delivery of up to 4 programmes involving up to 100 participants, subject to budget availability on an ongoing basis. The final programme costs will not be available until the procurement process is completed but it is

likely that the cost for each programme will be in the region of £50,000. The amount has been set aside in budget estimates for the coming financial year and is included in the mediumterm financial plans.

3.18 Inclusive Growth

While this programme is driven by the economic objectives of the Belfast Agenda, the need to pursue an inclusive growth agenda is also clear throughout the Agenda. This commitment will help shape the specific interventions, ensuring that, where opportunities are created, specific efforts are made to consider how Belfast residents can avail of these opportunities

3.19 Financial and resource implications

It is clear that this programme of work is a significant step-up from the current provision. This will require additional investment from the Council as well as the ability to lever partnership funding from other public and private sector organisations. It will also take a number of years to build up the services and to demonstrate progress.

- 3.20 As part of the rate setting process, some preliminary financial assessment has taken place around the delivery of priority areas for the Belfast Agenda. At this stage officers have recommended a total of £750,000 be included in the rate to enable these services to be developed in 2017/18 along with the Belfast Works Programme and the Smart Cities Framework.
- 3.21 Funding for existing programmes which are supported by ERDF funding, including Go Social, Business Start and Business Growth programmes have been built into the departmental estimates.
- 3.22 The Procurement Support Programme will cost £50,000 per programme approval is required to commission up to four programmes over a four year period, subject to satisfactory performance and budget availability. This cost is accounted for in the Development Department's estimates for 17/18.

3.23 Equality and good relations implications

Programmes have and will continue to be designed to help remove barriers to participation and promote equality of opportunity.'

In response to a Member's question in relation to how the Council could better inform the public about the major projects and developments in which it was involved, the Director of Development advised the Committee that he had recently met with Dublin City Council, which issued a bi-annual 'Dublin Economic Monitor' magazine which indicated the economic performance across the four local authorities in Dublin. The Chief Executive advised the Members that she had spoken with the Director of Development about the idea and that they were considering producing a similar publication for Belfast.

The Committee adopted the recommendations.

Finance, Procurement and Performance

Risk Update - Corporate risk

The Director of City Centre Development advised the Committee that, in August 2016, the Chief Officers had undertaken a comprehensive risk review and had identified sixteen corporate risks. She reported that the 'failure to deliver the City Centre Regeneration and Investment Strategy (CCRIS)' had been identified as a key risk.

She advised the Committee that there were both internal and external factors which could impact upon the delivery of the programme. These included:

- market failure / economic downturn;
- lack of buy-in / financial support from key external stakeholders;
- lack of clear land use policy;
- insufficient or ineffective use of resources;
- failure to comply with legal regulations e.g. State Aid;
- reputational damage due to lack of good governance; and
- failure to properly define or measure outcomes.

She outlined to the Members the action plan which had been created to manage the risks and how the actions would lower the overall risk rating from high to significant.

The Director reported that a number of controls were already in place to manage the risks, including an approved strategy which set out a clear direction of travel, a robust governance structure, a monthly Programme Board chaired by the Chief Executive, as well as legal and policy processes around procurement and economic appraisals.

The Members were also advised that there were a number of sources of assurance, including economic data, external stakeholder groups and Project Boards and programme and project plans with milestones and financial assessments.

The Committee noted:

 the key risks which could impact on the delivery of the CCRIS, the controls that had recently been put in place and the additional risk actions that were required; and

 that the risk management plan would be implemented over the next four months, with an update on delivery submitted to the Committee in May, 2017.

Chairperson