

Development Management Officer Report Committee Application

Summary	
Committee Meeting Date: 11 June 2019	
Application ID:	LA04/2018/2445/LBC
Proposal: Internal and external alterations to existing building to facilitate a change of use and extension.	Location: Former Butchers Building 108 North Street and 1 Gresham Street Belfast and adjacent lands to the North-West.
Referral Route: Linked to Major application (LA04/2018/2470/O)	
Recommendation: Approval	
Applicant Name and Address: Bywater and Ashmour 46 James Street Marylebone London W1U 1EZ	Agent Name and Address: TSA Planning 20 May Street Belfast BT1 4NL
<p>Executive Summary: The application seeks Listed Building consent for the internal and external alterations and extension of existing listed 'Butchers' building including change of use from retail (all floors) to café/restaurant at ground floor and office at first and second floors with all associated site works.</p> <p>The key issues in the assessment of the proposed development include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Impact on Listed Building. <p>The site lies within the northern part of the city centre, which is arguably the most poorly defined in terms of land use and built form, characterised by dereliction and inactive ground floor frontages.</p> <p>The change of use to café at ground floor and office above will create a mix of uses entirely suitable for this city centre location and will contribute to an active ground floor frontage which this area is very much in need of.</p> <p>HED have welcomed the re-use of the listed building and have no objections in terms of the principle of extending the building. The extension will provide a lightweight built link to a 6 storey block on North Street, part of the wider redevelopment proposal for the site subject to outline planning application LA04/2018/2470/O.</p> <p>However Historic Environment Division have objected in relation to the width of the proposal on the basis that it is too narrow to provide a suitable built buffer onto the proposed adjoining block to the immediate west (subject to parallel outline application LA04/2018/2470/O for wider redevelopment of adjoining car park). The predominantly glazed link, with a strong vertical emphasis will appear almost akin to the width of a traditional alleyway and create a lightweight contemporary link between the listed 'Butchers Building' and the traditionally styled new build, which has been modelled on an old mill building. The extension in itself, given its lightweight and passive architectural style, should not harm the character of the listed building, which previously had an adjoining terrace of equal or greater height and of a more solid built form. Further information has been submitted in an attempt to address HED concerns, HED have yet to</p>	

comment on this information. However given that the width of the extension has remained unaltered it is not likely that this aspect of their objection will change.

Consultees

DFC Historic Environment Division – Await response. Likely to maintain their objection.

Recommendation

Having had regard to the extant development plan, the draft development plan, relevant planning policies, planning approvals in the area, economic benefits and other material considerations the proposed development is considered on balance acceptable.

Given the proposed extension is linked to a larger redevelopment scheme, it is essential that both the proposed extension, and the adjoining scheme (LA04/2018/2470/O) are delivered in tandem. This will be secured via condition.

It is recommended that delegated authority is given to the Director of Planning and Building Control to grant Listed Building Consent with conditions subject to notification to the Department for Infrastructure (Dfi).

Signature(s):

Case Officer Report

Site Location Plan



1.0	Description of Proposed Development
1.1	Alteration and extension of existing listed building to facilitate proposed change of use (LA04/2018/2464/F) and provision of 120 sqm food and beverage space and 318 sqm of office space.
2.0	Description of Site
2.1	Established three storey traditional building located to immediate north-east of surface level car park.

2.2	<p>A three-storey Mannerist-style, former Gas Showrooms, previously one of a terrace, now the only block remaining. Rectangular on plan, one-bay wide along North Street with chamfered corner bay and four bays wide along Gresham Street. Three partially hipped slate roofs over each linear bay; roof of southern-most bay has been levelled and a square-plan, timber frame and glazed addition added.</p>
2.2	<p>North-east proportion of ground floor is characterized by five openings, including canted entrance bay, each having polished granite columns on either side, carrying the cornice above. Shop window to ground floor and modern glazed entrance door to chamfered corner. East elevation has four regularly arranged windows across upper floors, except for single oculus to far left of first floor. Ground floor is asymmetrical with three shop windows to right-side; left-side contains a timber door. South elevation is one bay wide with a single window to first floor. West elevation is largely roughcast brick with some smooth render and paint to upper right-side and is completely blank as it was previously abutted by adjoining building.</p> <p>The following zonings apply to the site:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Belfast Urban Area Plan – Within Main Office Area - Draft Belfast Metropolitan Area Plan (2004) – Within the Main Office Area and Primary Retail Core. The site also lies within the ‘Old City’ Character Area CC012. - Draft Belfast Metropolitan Area Plan (2015) – Site located within a larger development opportunity site (CC016) and within the ‘Old City’ Character Area CC009.
<p>Planning Assessment of Policy and other Material Considerations</p>	
3.0	<p>Planning History</p>
3.1	<p>LA04/2018/2470/O Proposal: Mixed use regeneration and development of vacant surface level car park and refurbishment of existing listed Butchers building, with erection of new fixed use buildings (heights varying between 3-9 storeys). Proposal to comprise basement level car parking, ground floor retail/restaurant/coffee shop/workspace uses, with Grade A and SME offices above. Provision of new pedestrian accesses from Gresham and Winetavern Street; associated public realm, landscaping, associated plant, and all site and access works.</p> <p>Address: Vacant lands at existing, level Carpark bounded by, Winetavern Street, Gresham Street and, North Street, including 108 North Street and 1 Gresham Street, Belfast.</p> <p>Decision: Current application</p>
3.2	<p>LA04/2018/2464/F Proposal: Alteration and extension of existing listed building including change of use from retail (all floors) to café/restaurant at ground floor and office at first and second floors with all associated site works.</p> <p>Address: Former Butchers Building, 108 North Street and, 1 Gresham Street, Belfast, and adjacent lands to the North-West.</p> <p>Decision: Current application</p>
4.0	<p>Policy Framework</p>
4.1	<p>Belfast Urban area Plan 2001 Draft Belfast Metropolitan Area Plan 2015 Draft Belfast Local Development Plan Strategy (Draft LDP) Public Local Inquiry into Objections to the Belfast Metropolitan Area Plan 2015 Part 2 ‘Report on Belfast City Council Area’</p>

4.2	Regional Development Strategy (RDS) 2035 Strategic Planning Policy Statement for Northern Ireland Policy Statement 6 - Planning, Archaeology and the Built Heritage
4.3	Section 91(2) of the Planning Act (Northern Ireland) 2011 requires that the City Council, when making its decision, must have special regard to the desirability of preserving the [Listed] building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.
5.0	Statutory Consultees Historic Environment Division - Objection
6.0	Non-Statutory Consultees
7.0	Representations No public objections have been received.
8.0	Other Material Considerations The Belfast Agenda
9.0	Assessment
9.1	The key issues in the assessment of the proposed development include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Impact on Listed Building
9.2	<p>Impact on Listed Building</p> <p>The proposal has been assessed against the Strategic Policy Planning Statement for Northern Ireland (SPPS): Planning for Sustainable Development, specifically paragraphs:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 6.12 Development proposals impacting on Setting of Listed Buildings; - 6.13 Change of Use, Extension or Alteration of a Listed Building; <p>Planning Policy Statement 6: Planning, Archaeology and the Built Heritage, specifically policies:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - BH 7 (Change of Use of a Listed Building) - BH 8 (Extension or Alteration of a Listed Building); and - BH 11 (Development affecting the Setting of a Listed Building).
9.3	The proposal has been assessed against Policy BH 8 which deals with Extensions or Alterations of a Listed Building and also paragraphs 6.12-6.15 of the SPPS. Historic Environment Division have advised that the proposed alterations to the listed building itself appear to comply with policy because the majority of the west gable was abutted by a terrace that has since been demolished. They have however raised concerns regarding the relationship with the proposed redevelopment of the adjoining site (subject to LA04/2018/2470/O), in particular in relation to the width of the proposed extension. They have advised that <i>'Given that this scheme is associated with a much larger scale development, a 6m wide building of same height as the former butcher's shop is requested to respect the listed building'</i> .
9.4	However it is important to look at the proposal as a standalone extension to the listed building, which is the subject of this planning application. Although it will inevitably be read with the adjoining built form the extension in itself must be considered in terms of its scale, massing and design.
9.5	However it is important to look at the proposal as a standalone extension to the listed building. Although it will inevitably be read with the adjoining built form the extension in itself must be considered in terms of its scale, massing and design. It is worth pointing out that the existing setting can be viewed as somewhat negative, with the listed building appearing isolated, which in turn accentuates its narrow plan form.

9.6	<p>HED have noted the revised design of the proposed extension, from solid form to glazing and recognise the references to the historic fabric and detailing of the Listed Building and agree that the style is acceptable. The simplistic design of the extension, heavily glazed with its nod to the more traditional vertical emphasis of the Butchers Building, ensures that it will be subservient to the strong character of the listed building and will ensure it retains its integrity and dominance. The extension also serves to increase the presence of the listed building, currently isolated, whilst at the same time separating it from its proposed neighbouring buildings (LA04/2018/2470/O), providing a suitable buffer from the larger building and integrating it into the new street frontage along North Street and Gresham Street. Given the proposal is intrinsically linked to this larger redevelopment scheme, it is essential that both are delivered in tandem (should outline permission be granted), particularly given the lack of detail on the exposed western elevation of the extension. To ensure this comprehensive redevelopment of the site a condition will be attached, as detailed below at 11.2. Alternatively, should outline permission not be granted, delegated authority is requested to agree details of the gable elevation of the proposed extension, in consultation with Historic Environment Division.</p>
9.7	<p>The proposed extension, adding a bay to the North Street elevation, is a crucial part of establishing the integrity of the listed building as part of the new urban block, stepping up to 6 storeys and then 9 storeys on the North Street Winetavern Street corner.</p>
9.8	<p>Further detailed and supporting information has been submitted in an attempt to address HED's concerns. However given their strong stance in relation to the width of the proposed extension it is likely that that they will retain their objection.</p>
10.0	<p>Summary of Recommendation:</p>
10.1	<p>The proposal will facilitate the change of use of the former 'Butchers' building to provide a café at ground floor level and offices above.</p>
10.2	<p>The proposed extension is appropriate to the scale of the Butchers Building and will assist in the enhancement of its setting, which at the moment sees it isolated in the corner of a surface level car park. The width and design of the extension, with a lightweight glazed structure will ensure that the listed building retains its primacy and dominance, whilst also providing a buffer between the proposed redevelopment scheme (LA04/2018/2470/O), stepping up to a 6 storey building on North Street.</p>
10.3	<p>It is recommended that delegated authority is given to the Director of Planning and Building Control to grant Listed Building Consent with conditions subject to notification to the Department for Infrastructure (Dfi).</p>
11.0	<p>Conditions</p>
11.1	<p>The works hereby permitted shall be begun not later than the expiration of 5 years beginning with the date on which this consent is granted.</p> <p>Reason: As required by Section 94 of the Planning Act (Northern Ireland) 2011.</p>
11.2	<p>The extension hereby approved shall not be constructed unless a contract has been signed for the redevelopment of the adjoining site in accordance with outline planning permission LA04/2018/2470/O.</p> <p>Reason: To ensure the comprehensive development of the site and in the interests of visual amenity.</p> <p>Informatives</p> <p>This consent shall be read in conjunction with the planning approval LA04/2018/2464/F.</p>

12.0	Notification to Department (if relevant) Yes. Objection from a statutory consultee – Historic Environment Division
13.0	Representations from elected members: None received
Neighbour Notification Checked	
N/A	
Signature(s)	
Date:	

ANNEX	
Date Valid	8th October 2018
Date First Advertised	26th October 2018
Date Last Advertised	26th October 2018
Date of Last Neighbour Notification	N/A
Date of EIA Determination	N/A
ES Requested	N/A
Drawing Numbers and Title	09/B – Ground Floor 10/B – First Floor 11/B – Second Floor 12/A – Roof 13/B – Elevations 14/B – Sections 15/A – ‘Connection’ Details 16/A - Repairs
Notification to Department	Yes. Objection from a statutory consultee – Historic Environment Division