


**Development Management Officer Report
Committee Application**

Summary	
Committee Meeting Date: 21st January 2020	
Application ID: LA04/2019/2052/LBC	
Proposal: Alterations to building including the removal of a small single storey rear extension, the provision of a new staircase, and a replacement roof to facilitate a change of use from retail to flexible retail/café/restaurant/cultural use at ground floor and to flexible retail/café/restaurant/cultural/office use on the upper floors	Location: J Braddell and Sons, 11 North Street, Belfast BT1 1NA
Referral Route: Associated with a Major Application	
Recommendation:	Grant consent subject to conditions
Applicant Name and Address: PG Ltd 49 Berkeley Square London W1J 5AZ	Agent Name and Address: Savills Embassy House Queens Avenue Bristol BS8 1SB
Executive Summary:	
<p>Listed Building Consent is sought for works to Braddells 11 North Street, a Grade B1 listed building, as part of a wider regeneration scheme for land formerly known as Royal Exchange. The proposal seeks to facilitate change of use to retail/restaurant/café use on the ground floor and office/cultural use on upper floors, including partial demolition of a small rear extension (part single storey and part two storey), internal alterations including the insertion of a lift to improve accessibility, removal of floor area to accommodate stairs to the third floor, removal of floor boards and joists to create a double height space, previously infilled openings to be reformed and a new attic window.</p> <p>Listed Building Consent was previously granted for Braddells as part of a wider regeneration scheme of land formerly known as Royal Exchange, referred to as the extant scheme. This permission has commenced therefore the extant scheme could be implemented and is a material consideration of significant importance in the assessment of this proposal. This Listed Building application proposes less intervention than the extant scheme which is an important material consideration.</p> <p>HED considers that the proposal satisfies policy subject to conditions.</p> <p><u>Recommendation</u> Having regard to all material considerations, including the previous consent, it is recommended that Listed Building Consent is granted subject to conditions.</p> <p>It is recommended that delegated authority is given to the Director of Planning and Building Control to finalise the wording of the conditions.</p>	

Case Officer Report	
1.0	Plans
	<p>LA04/2019/2052/LBC</p>  <p style="text-align: center;">Site Location Plan</p>
2.0	<p>Description of Proposed Development</p> <p>The proposal seeks works to facilitate the change of use of the building to retail/café/restaurant on the ground floor and cultural/office uses on upper floors. The works include partial demolition of a small rear extension, internal and external works. Restoration of the front facade, windows and roof repairs are also proposed. Internal alterations include the insertion of a lift to improve accessibility, removal of floor area to accommodate stairs to the third floor, removal of floor boards and joists to create a double height space, previously infilled openings to be reformed and a new attic window.</p>
3.0	<p>Description of the Site</p> <p>Braddells is a Grade B1 listed building located at 11 North Street built around the 1890s. It comprises a 4 storey, red brick gabled building.</p> <p>The proposal is part of a wider scheme to regenerate the area along North Street, Donegall Street and Rosemary Street (Ref: LA04/2017/2341/O), which is being considered at the same Planning Committee meeting.</p>
4.0	Planning Assessment of Policy and Other Material Considerations
4.1	Planning History
4.1.1	<p>Listed building consent (Ref: Z/2012/0084/LBC) was previously granted in October 2012 for works to Braddells as part of a wider regeneration scheme (Z/2010/1532/F & LA04/2016/2327/F) hereafter referred to as the 'extant scheme'. The approved works to</p>

	Braddells included partial demolition of a rear extension, a new rear internal staircase and a fourth floor extension. Relevant planning history is provided at Appendix 1.
4.2	Policy Framework
4.2.1	<u>Regional Planning Policy</u> Regional Development Strategy 2035 (RDS) Strategic Planning Policy Statement for Northern Ireland (SPPS)
4.2.2	<u>Local Planning Policy Context</u> Belfast Urban Area Plan 2001 (BUAP) Draft Belfast Metropolitan Area Plan 2015 Draft Belfast Metropolitan Area Plan 2004
4.2.3	Planning Policy Statement 6 (PPS6) – Archaeology and the Built Environment
5.0	Consultations <u>Statutory Consultee</u> DFC Historic Environment Division (HED) – no objection subject to conditions.
6.0	Representations The application has been advertised and no representations have been received.
7.0	Assessment
7.1	Regional Policy Context
7.1.1	Planning Policy Statement 6: Planning Archaeology and the Built Heritage (PPS6) sets out policies against which the application is assessed. These include: Policy BH 8 – Extension or Alteration of a Listed Building Policy BH 10 – Demolition of a Listed Building
7.1.2	The SPPS also sets out policy considerations for Listed Buildings at paragraphs 6.12 – 6.15.
7.2	Background
7.2.1	The Braddells building was constructed in the 1890s and is an important example of a largely unaltered Victorian building with the red brick finish and gabled features central to its historic character. The proposals for Braddells are to facilitate a change of use of the ground floor to retail/café/restaurant and the upper floors to cultural/office use and include partial demolition of the later non-original part single and part two storey rear extension, internal alterations including reopening a previously infilled opening to provide a new staircase at the third floor and a lift to improve accessibility within the building. External works are also proposed to the front, rear and side elevation and to the roof.
7.2.2	The building is currently vacant but had been used for retail purposes since 1975 by J. Braddell & Sons and more recently as a shop/art gallery on the ground floor with art studio on upper floors. HED is content in principle with the change of use of the upper floors to cultural/office under Policy BH7.

7.3	Demolition
7.3.1	Policy BH10 (Demolition of a Listed Building) of PPS6 states that there will be a presumption in favour of retaining listed buildings unless there are exceptional reasons why the building cannot be retained in its original or a reasonably modified form.
7.3.2	Partial demolition of a small rear extension (part single storey and part two storey) is proposed. Internal demolition includes removal of a floor area to accommodate a new lift, an existing previously infilled opening to be reformed and partial area of floor to accommodate stairs to the third floor. HED are content with the removal of the rear extension under Policy BH 11. A similar proposal for Braddells was approved as part of the extant scheme, which included a new rear internal staircase and a fourth floor extension and can still be implemented. The revised scheme does not include the proposed rear staircase or fourth floor extension and proposes less intervention than the extant scheme. In this regard, the current proposal is considered more sympathetic to the Listed Building Consent than the extant scheme. This is an important material consideration which has significant weight in the assessment of this proposal.
7.3.3	Paragraph 6.25 of PPS 6 requires that where proposed works would result in the total demolition of a listed building, or a significant part of it, the Council, in addition to considering the general criteria, will also address a number of additional factors including (a) the condition of the building/cost of repairing and maintaining it, (b) the adequacy of efforts made to retain the building and (c) the merits of alternative proposals. In this case the partial demolition relates to a small part of the building which was a later non-original extension and is not considered a significant part of it'.
7.3.4	Regard is also had to the following benefits:
7.3.5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Restoration of the historically important and architecturally significant building securing the future use and maintenance of this important listed building; • Enhancement to the streetscape and Conservation Area; and • Provision of active ground floor uses enhancing the vitality and viability of the area.
7.3.6	The substantial benefits for the community set out above and in the associated report LA04/2017/2341/O are considered to add to the case for granting Listed Building Consent. Furthermore, the extant scheme is a fall-back, which could be implemented as an alternative to the current proposal. This Listed Building application proposes less intervention and is an important material consideration which has significant weight in the assessment of this proposal and the proposed partial demolition is considered acceptable under Policy BH 10.
7.4	Proposed Alterations/Extension
7.4.1	Policy BH8 (Extension or Alteration of a Listed Building) of PPS6 states that consent for the extension or alteration of a listed building will normally be granted where all of the following criteria have been met:
7.4.2	<p>a) the essential character of the building and its setting are retained and its features of special interest remain intact and unimpaired;</p> <p>b) the works proposed make use of traditional and/or sympathetic building materials and techniques which match or are in keeping with those found on the building; and</p> <p>c) the architectural details (doors, gutters, windows) match or are in keeping with the building.</p>

<p>7.4.3</p> <p>7.4.4</p> <p>7.3.6</p> <p>7.3.7</p>	<p>Internal alterations include partial removal of a floor area to accommodate a new lift, an existing previously infilled opening to be reformed and partial area of floor to be removed to accommodate proposed stairs to the third floor. In addition, alterations include removal of joists and boards to create a double height space on the third floor, works to the roof including new front and rear roof lights along with the cleaning/repairs to windows, cills, shopfront and brickwork.</p> <p>The interior of the building will not be significantly affected by proposed works and the building will be largely retained in its current form therefore the essential character of the building and its setting will be retained and its features of special interest will remain intact and unimpaired which satisfies criterion a). A method statement for works to the building is set out in Appendix A in the Design and Access Statement and demonstrates that the proposed works will make use of traditional and/or sympathetic building materials and techniques which match or are in keeping with those found on the building, thereby satisfying criterion b). The architectural detailing will match or will be in keeping with that found on the building, thereby satisfying criterion c).</p> <p>Braddells sits adjacent to Nos. 7-9 North Street which is proposed to be demolished and Nos.13-15 North Street which is proposed to be partially demolished. A new Mews lane is proposed to run from North Street along the southern side of Braddells through to Donegall Street. The southern elevation is finished in masonry and it is proposed to finish this in either exposed brick or lime depending on its condition.</p> <p>HED is content with the proposal subject to conditions. Officers consider that the proposal for Braddells is compliant with relevant planning policy set out in PPS 6 and the SPPS.</p>
<p>9.0</p> <p>9.1</p> <p>9.2</p>	<p>Summary of Recommendation:</p> <p>Having regard to the Development Plan, the extant permission and relevant material considerations, the proposal is considered acceptable.</p> <p>It is recommended that delegated authority is given to the Director of Planning and Building Control to grant Listed Building Consent subject to conditions.</p>
<p>10.0</p>	<p>Conditions:</p> <p>1. The works hereby permitted shall be begun not later than the expiration of 5 years beginning with the date on which this consent is granted.</p> <p>Reason: As required by Section 94 of the Planning Act (Northern Ireland) 2011.</p> <p>2. Prior to commencement of works details shall be submitted and approved in writing by the Council of access that shall be afforded to the Council during the work for monitoring purposes.</p> <p>Reason: To ensure that special regard is paid to protecting the special architectural and historic interest and integrity of the building under Section 80 of The Planning Act (NI) 2011.</p> <p>3. Prior to commencement of works details shall be submitted and approved in writing by the Council in conjunction with HED of a Fire Safety Strategy and Method Statement for the duration of the works. The works shall be carried out in accordance with the details approved.</p>

Reason: To ensure that special regard is paid to protecting the special architectural and historic interest and integrity of the building under Section 80 of The Planning Act (NI) 2011.

4. Prior to commencement of works details shall be submitted and approved in writing by the Council in conjunction with HED showing the areas to be demolished and setting out the method of ensuring the safety and stability of the building fabric identified to be retained throughout the phases of demolition and reconstruction. Such details shall include structural engineering drawings and/or a method statement. The work shall be carried out fully in accordance with the details approved.

Reason: To ensure that special regard is paid to protecting the special architectural and historic interest and integrity of the building under Section 80 of The Planning Act (NI) 2011.

5. All new external and internal works and finishes and works of making good to the retained fabric, shall match the existing original work adjacent in respect of methods, detailed execution and finished appearance unless otherwise approved in writing by the City Council.

Reason: To ensure that special regard is paid to protecting the special architectural and historic interest and integrity of the building under Section 80 of The Planning Act (NI) 2011.

6. Prior to commencement of development the following details shall be submitted and approved in writing by the Council in conjunction with HED and the works shall be carried out fully in accordance with the details approved.

- (a) Samples of internal materials and surface finishes;
- (b) Survey and method statement for existing window repair; and
- (c) Splice repair of timber beams.

Reason: To ensure that special regard is paid to protecting the special architectural and historic interest and integrity of the building under Section 80 of The Planning Act (NI) 2011.

7. No new plumbing, pipes, soil-stacks, flues, vents or ductwork shall be fixed on the external faces of the building other than those shown on the drawings hereby approved.

Reason: To ensure that special regard is paid to protecting the special architectural and historic interest and integrity of the building under Section 80 of The Planning Act (NI) 2011.

8. All cleaning of the existing façade shall conform to BS 8221-1:2012 (Code of practice for cleaning and surface repair of buildings. Cleaning of natural stone, brick, terracotta and concrete). Method to be agreed in writing with the Council in conjunction with HED prior to commencement of façade cleaning.

Reason: To ensure that special regard is paid to protecting the special architectural and historic interest and integrity of the building under Section 80 of The Planning Act (NI) 2011.

9. Prior to commencement of work to the roof, the following details shall be submitted and approved in writing by the Council in conjunction with HED and the works shall be carried out fully in accordance with the details approved.

- (a) replacement sample if sufficient slate is not salvageable from the existing roof;
- (b) patent glazing for roof lantern if existing is deemed beyond repair;
- (c) the means of ventilating the roof, i.e. where insulation is inserted between rafters, to prevent condensation / rot of existing timber structure.

Reason: To ensure that special regard is paid to specific architectural features or fixtures and to ensure the fabric is protected from damage during the course of works.

10. Prior to commencement of works, details shall be submitted and approved in writing by the Council in conjunction with HED of proposed precautions to secure and protect the interior features during the building work. The work shall be carried out fully in accordance with the details approved. No such features shall be disturbed or removed temporarily or permanently except as indicated on the approved drawings or without the prior approval in writing of the Council, in conjunction with HED. Particular regard should be given to the following items:

- (a) Ground, third, and fourth floor stairs balusters and handrails which are labelled on drawing as to be retained and closed off;
- (b) Existing roof structure; and
- (c) Existing timber beams and floor boards to be retained.

Reason: To ensure that special regard is paid to specific architectural features or fixtures and to ensure the fabric is protected from damage during the course of works.

11. No works shall be undertaken unless a sample panel of the following design elements have been provided on site and approved in writing by the City Council.

- (a) Brickwork, to include pointing mortar mix, joint thickness and finish profile;
- (b) Render, to include lime mix and final surface texture.

The works shall not be carried out unless in accordance with the approved details.

The approved sample panel(s) shall be retained on site until the work is completed.

Reason: To ensure that special regard is paid to specific architectural features or fixtures and to ensure the fabric is protected from damage during the course of works.

Notification to Department (if relevant)

Date of Notification to Department: Not required

ANNEX	
Date Valid	30th August 2019
Date First Advertised	20th September 2019
Date Last Advertised	
Date of Last Neighbour Notification	
Date of EIA Determination	
ES Requested	No

APPENDIX 1 – RELEVANT PLANNING HISTORY

Current Outline planning application and associated consents

The table below sets out the applications and consents currently under consideration for the revised scheme.

Planning Application Reference	Address	Proposal
LA04/2017/2341/O	Land Bounded by Royal Avenue, York Street and Church Street to the North; North Street to the west; Rosemary Street to the south and High Street to the south; and Donegall Street to the east. The site is located approximately 300m west of Laganside Bus Station, 300m northeast of City Hall and 900m northwest of Central Train Station.	Application for outline planning permission for demolition, redevelopment and part change of use to create a mixed use development comprising retail, offices, cafe/restaurant, residential, hotel, cultural/community space, parking, servicing, access and circulation arrangements, the creation of new streets, the configuration of Writers Square, public realm works, landscaping and associated site and road works. The proposal includes works to alter listed buildings, restoration of retained listed buildings and facades, and partial demolition of North Street Arcade, retaining its facades. Details of the retained elements of the Listed Braddells building, Former Assembly Rooms and North Street Arcade facades are provided along with the layout of the new Arcade
LA04/2019/2052/LBC	J Braddell and Sons, 11 North Street, Belfast, BT1 1NA.	Alterations to building including the removal of a small single storey rear extension, the provision of a new staircase, and a replacement roof to facilitate a change of use from retail to flexible retail/café/restaurant/cultural use at ground floor and to flexible retail/café/restaurant/cultural/office use on the upper floors

Extant scheme approvals and consents

The table below sets out the applications and consents relating to the extant scheme.

Planning Application Reference/ Decision	Address	Proposal
Z/2010/1532/F Permission granted 11 October 2012	Lands bounded by nos. 31-101 Royal Avenue, Church Street, William Street, Writers Square Nos 40 to 16 Donegall Street, No.2 Waring Street, 1-21 Bridge Street, Nos 2-18 High Street, Nos 1-27 Lombard Street, Nos 33 to 55 Rosemary Street and including North Street and Nos 2-14 Lower Garfield Street	Demolition, redevelopment and part change of use of existing buildings to create mixed use development comprising retail, offices, café/bar use, 2 no. retail pavilions, 205 apartments including 6 no. live/work units, with associated energy centre, service areas and above ground car parking, cultural/arts centre, hotel, 2-level basement car park and associated access and circulation, creation of new streets and public spaces, reconfiguration of Writers Square, public realm works, landscaping and associated site and road works. Application also comprises works to restore, alter and extend listed buildings and facades and partial demolition of North Street Arcade retaining its facades, partial reconstruction of end blocks and reconstruction of rotunda on original location.
Z/2012/0084/LBC Consent granted 11 October 2012	11 North Street, Belfast	Existing buildings to be retained in retail use on ground and first floors and renovated for reuse as residential space on upper floors including alteration to rear of building to include vertical circulation to upper floors

Variations to extant scheme

The table below sets out the applications and consents relating varied the original approval for the extant scheme.

Planning Application Reference/ Decision	Address	Proposal
LA04/2016/2327/F Permission granted 23 January 2017	Lands bounded by Nos. 31-101 Royal Avenue, Church Street, William Street, Writers Square, Nos. 40 to 16 Donegall Street, No. 2 Waring Street, 1-21 Bridge Street, Nos. 2-18 High Street, Nos 1-	Application to Vary conditions 2-4 (demolition and construction), 6, 8-13 (traffic and parking), 14-18 (contaminated land), 21-22, 25, 27, 29 (landscaping), 30-31 (archaeology) and 33 (environmental designations) of planning permission Z/2010/1532/F for the demolition, redevelopment and part change of use of existing buildings to create mixed use

	27 Lombard Street and Nos. 2-14 Lower Garfield Street, Belfast	development known as Royal Exchange, comprising retail, offices, café/bar use, apartments, car parking, cultural/arts centre, hotel and associated access and circulation and public realm works, including restoration, alteration and extension of listed buildings.
--	--	--